Less Remineralized Carbon in the Intermediate-Depth South Atlantic During Heinrich Stadial 1

Matthew Lacerra1,2, David C. Lund3, Geoffrey Gebbie3, Delia W. Oppo4,5, Jimin Yu4, Andreas Schmittner2, and Natalie E. Umling4,5

1Department of Marine Sciences, University of Connecticut, Groton, CT, USA, 2Now at Department of Geosciences, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA, 3Department of Physical Oceanography, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA, USA, 4Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA, USA, 5Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, American Museum of Natural History, New York, NY, USA, 6Research School of Earth Sciences, Australian National University, Acton, ACT, Australia, 7College of Earth, Ocean, and Atmospheric Sciences, Oregon State University, Corvallis, OR, USA

Abstract The last deglaciation (~20–10 kyr BP) was characterized by a major shift in Earth’s climate state, when the global mean surface temperature rose ~4 °C and the concentration of atmospheric CO2 increased ~80 ppmv. Model simulations suggest that the initial 30 ppmv rise in atmospheric CO2 may have been driven by reduced efficiency of the biological pump or enhanced upwelling of carbon-rich waters from the abyssal ocean. Here we evaluate these hypotheses using benthic foraminiferal B/Ca (a proxy for deep water [CO3^2-]) increased by 22 ± 2 μmol/kg early in Heinrich Stadial 1, or a decrease in ΣCO2 of approximately 40 μmol/kg, assuming there were no significant changes in alkalinity. Our data imply that remineralized phosphate declined by approximately 0.3 μmol/kg during Heinrich Stadial 1, equivalent to 40% of the modern remineralized signal at this location. Because tracer inversion results indicate remineralized phosphate at the core site reflects the integrated effect of export production in the sub-Antarctic, our results imply that biological productivity in the Atlantic sector of the Southern Ocean was reduced early in the deglaciation, contributing to the initial rise in atmospheric CO2.

1. Introduction

One of the defining features of the last deglaciation is the 30-ppmv rise in atmospheric CO2 early in Heinrich Stadial 1 (HS1; 17.5–14.5 kyr BP; Monnin et al., 2001; Lourantou et al., 2010). Changes in mean global temperatures lagged atmospheric CO2 by ~500 years throughout the deglaciation (Shakun et al., 2012), suggesting that atmospheric CO2 was a primary driver of Earth’s transition from a glacial to interglacial state. While recent ice core analyses have provided an unprecedented level of detail for the evolution of CO2 (Marcott et al., 2014), the mechanisms responsible for these changes remain poorly understood. Carbon isotopic analyses of atmospheric CO2 suggest numerous oceanic and terrestrial processes were viable contributors, making signal deconvolution a difficult task (Bauska et al., 2016). However, new atmospheric δ13C records from Marine Isotope Stage 3 (which exhibits millennial-scale variability similar to the last deglaciation) imply that atmospheric CO2 increase during HS1, when the δ13C of atmospheric CO2 decreased by 0.3–0.4‰, may be linked to changes in the ocean’s biological pump (Bauska et al., 2016; Bauska et al., 2018).

The biological pump is the process by which carbon is exported from the surface ocean as organic material and subsequently remineralized to dissolved inorganic carbon (ΣCO2, Rem) at depth (Schmittner & Galbraith, 2008). The biological pump affects atmospheric CO2 through two processes: the soft tissue pump and secondarily through the hard tissue or carbonate pump. The first process acts to draw down atmospheric CO2 by removing CO2 (aq) from the surface ocean, decreasing surface water pCO2, and moving the remaining surface ΣCO2 pool toward [CO3^2-] (Ito & Follows, 2005). The carbonate pump has the opposite effect, partially counteracting the soft tissue pump by removing alkalinity (ALK) and ΣCO2 from the surface ocean in a 2:1 ratio and thereby increasing pCO2 (Hain et al., 2010). In the modern ocean, the soft tissue pump maintains approximately 60–70% of the surface to deep ΣCO2 gradient. The other 30–40% is maintained by the “solubility pump,” a function of overturning circulation strength and physical properties such as temperature and the rate of air-sea gas exchange in regions where surface waters sink into the ocean interior.
Areas of deep water formation in the North Atlantic and Southern Ocean have disparate levels of biological pump efficiency. High nutrient utilization in waters supplied to the North Atlantic results in North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW) having low preformed phosphate, allowing carbon sequestration in the ocean interior. Less nutrient utilization in the Southern Ocean results in southern sourced Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW) having high preformed phosphate, promoting “leakage” of carbon to the atmosphere (Ito & Follows, 2005). Therefore, global ocean biological pump efficiency may be altered either by a change in the relative proportions of NADW and AABW in the ocean interior or by altering the degree of nutrient utilization in end-member surface waters. Note that while we use the term biological pump efficiency to describe the completeness of nutrient consumption in surface waters (e.g., 0–100%), we will also make use of the term biological pump strength, a measure of total export production out of the surface mixed layer (e.g., grams per area per unit time).

Here we propose that the initial 30-ppmv rise in atmospheric CO₂ during HS1 was driven by reduced global biological pump efficiency, linked to the following: (1) weakening of the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC), (2) reduced iron fertilization in the sub-Antarctic Zone (SAZ) of the Southern Ocean, or (3) some combination of these effects. Under a reduced AMOC state, the more efficient northern sourced limb of the overturning circulation (NADW production) ventilates a smaller proportion of the ocean interior, lowering global average biological pump efficiency and raising atmospheric CO₂ (Ito & Follows, 2005). Similarly, reduced efficiency in the Southern Ocean would allow CO₂ to accumulate in the surface ocean, thereby yielding higher atmospheric CO₂ levels.

Model results suggest that AMOC collapse reduces not only biological pump efficiency but also global average biological pump strength (Chikamoto et al., 2008; Schmittner, 2005). Simulations of AMOC collapse using modern boundary conditions result in suppressed upwelling and a reduction in nutrient supply to the global surface ocean, which in turn reduces photosynthesis and export of carbon into the ocean interior (Schmittner, 2005). Reduced export of isotopically light carbon from the surface ocean to intermediate depths (900–1,300 m) decreases the surface-intermediate δ¹³C gradient by 0.7–0.9‰ (Schmittner & Lund, 2015). Intermediate-depth records from the Southern Hemisphere show that the benthic foraminiferal δ¹³C increase of ~0.3–0.5‰ during HS1 was accompanied by a decrease in planktonic foraminiferal δ¹³C of similar magnitude, consistent with the simulated reduction in vertical δ¹³C gradient (Bostock et al., 2004; Curry & Oppo, 2005; Hertzberg et al., 2016; Koutavas & Lynch-Stieglitz, 2003; Mix et al., 1991; Pahnke & Zahn, 2005).

Several lines of evidence suggest that the AMOC was weaker during HS1 (e.g., McManus et al., 2004; Chen et al., 2015), making an AMOC reduction a viable mechanism for decreasing biological pump efficiency during HS1. While an AMOC reduction yields substantial changes under modern interglacial conditions, deep waters originating from the surface Southern Ocean during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) likely had lower preformed nutrients (Sigman et al., 2010), which combined with an expanded volume of AABW (e.g., Curry & Oppo, 2005) would counteract the effect from a reduction in northern sourced waters. Thus, the maximum influence on atmospheric CO₂ concentrations during HS1 would occur through the combined effect of AMOC collapse and reduced biological pump efficiency in Southern Ocean surface waters.

A likely driver of Southern Ocean biological pump efficiency is wind-driven iron fertilization of the SAZ. In the modern SAZ, phytoplankton are unable to utilize all of the available phosphate and nitrate because their growth is iron limited, making the SAZ a high-nutrient and low-chlorophyll region (Martin, 1990). However, during glacial periods, evidence for greater iron flux within the SAZ, coupled with elevated δ¹⁵N of organic matter bound within the frustules of planktic foraminifera, suggests iron fertilization of the SAZ led to greater utilization of macronutrients and may account for as much as 40 ppmv of the glacial-interglacial atmospheric CO₂ drawdown (Martínez-García et al., 2009; Martínez-García et al., 2014). When wind-blowed delivery of iron to the SAZ was curtailed during glacial terminations, nutrient utilization efficiency and export production likely decreased (Martínez-García et al., 2014).

Additional mechanisms may account for the transfer of isotopically light carbon to the atmosphere during the LGM-HS1 transition. Toggweiler et al. (2006) suggested that a poleward shift in westerly winds and
alignment with the Antarctic Circumpolar Current would promote greater divergence in the surface Southern Ocean, resulting in enhanced upwelling of deep waters and outgassing of carbon to the atmosphere. Models that resolve mesoscale eddies in the Southern Ocean show a much weaker overturning response to enhanced westerlies, however (Farneti & Delworth, 2010). Spero and Lea (2002) also proposed that enhanced deep mixing in the Southern Ocean would result in the upwelling of isotopically light, carbon-rich deep waters to the surface. While widespread positive δ13C anomalies observed at intermediate depths during HS1 are inconsistent with this mechanism (Hertzberg et al., 2016), more recent modeling work by Menviel et al. (2018) suggests that liberation of light carbon from the ocean interior during the last deglaciation may cause positive δ13C anomalies throughout the South Atlantic and South Pacific below 500-m water depth. Considering that both the biological pump and deep liberation mechanisms could account for the observed upper ocean δ13C anomalies, additional constraints on the carbonate system are required to assess each hypothesis.

In this study, we use benthic foraminiferal B/Ca to evaluate carbon cycling in the intermediate-depth South Atlantic during HS1. Core top calibrations show a positive correlation between benthic B/Ca and the Δ[CO3^2−] of ambient deep waters (Rae et al., 2011; Yu & Elderfield, 2007). Using the relationship [CO3^2−] = Δ[CO3^2−] + [CO3^2−]initial, and subsequently, ΣCO2 ≈ ALK − [CO3^2−]/0.6 (Yu et al., 2016), the B/Ca proxy may be used to reconstruct past changes in water-column ΣCO2 concentrations (Lacerra et al., 2017; Yu et al., 2010; Yu et al., 2016). If enhanced upwelling of carbon-rich water occurred during HS1, then these sites should reflect evidence of higher ΣCO2 concentrations (Menviel et al., 2018; Spero & Lea, 2002). Such a signal would result in decreasing B/Ca across the LGM-HS1 transition, similar to mid-depth (~2,000 m) Atlantic records that reflect the accumulation of respired carbon associated with collapse of the AMOC (Lacerra et al., 2017; Yu et al., 2010). On the other hand, a weaker biological pump would decrease the export of organic material to depth, lowering the ΣCO2 content of mode and intermediate waters where the effect of remineralization is greatest (Martin et al., 1987).

In order to reconstruct ΣCO2 variability during the deglaciation, we analyzed benthic foraminifera from an intermediate-depth Brazil Margin core (KNR159-5-90GGC; 1,105-m water depth). The core site is located within the core of AAIW today (Figure 1) and is complemented by detailed time series of benthic δ18O and δ13C (Curry & Oppo, 2005; Umling et al., 2019). We compare our results to the output of a coupled ocean circulation-biogeochemistry model capable of resolving tracer field (δ13C, [CO3^2−], and ALK) responses to variable AMOC (Schmittner et al., 2013). Foraminiferal records show general agreement with model results (Hertzberg et al., 2016; Lacerra et al., 2017; Schmittner & Lund, 2015). Here, for the first time, we evaluate [CO3^2−] results from an intermediate-depth South Atlantic site and assess whether the signal is consistent with model simulations.

Considering core 90GGC is located along the boundary of the South Atlantic subtropical gyre, one would expect this core site to be nonideal for recording past variability in the biological pump. Modeled carbon export at 100-m water depth is low in subtropical gyre settings, suggesting minimal sensitivity to past changes in surface nutrient supply (Siegel et al., 2014). Nonetheless, close to 40% of the PO4^3− in the modern intermediate-depth South Atlantic can be attributed to remineralization (Gebbie, 2014; Ito & Follows, 2005). This discrepancy arises because the remineralization signal at the core site reflects the integrated effect of high-productivity sub-Antarctic surface waters as AAIW flows northward to the Brazil Margin. Thus, a reduction in export production in the sub-Antarctic would be expected to produce a positive B/Ca signal at our core site.

2. Methods

2.1. Core Sampling

Sediment samples were taken from intermediate-depth core KNR-159-5-90GGC (1,105 m; 27.35°S, 46.63°W). Samples were extracted at 2-cm intervals from 30 to 230 cm (n = 100), and an additional 15 samples were taken at intermittent levels from the core top to 30 cm. The sediment was freeze-dried, washed through a 63-μm sieve and dried at 40 °C overnight. The existing age model for the core indicates that sedimentation rates (8 to 31 cm/kyr) are sufficient to capture millennial-scale phenomena from the LGM to the
early Holocene (Lund et al., 2015). However, in the early deglacial interval of the core (105 to 150 cm), there is evidence of displacement of planktonic foraminifera from the late deglacial portion of the stratigraphy despite no evidence of displaced benthics (Lund et al., 2015). Similar to some other Brazil Margin sites, it appears that burrowing from upsection, where the ratio of planktonic to benthic shells can be ~100 times higher, creates the unique situation where planktonic records are sensitive to burrowing, while the benthic time series are not. In the early deglacial section of 90GGC, we therefore created an additional age control point by aligning the positive benthic $\delta^{13}C$ excursion in 90GGC with that in KNR159-5-36GGC, a Brazil Margin core from 1,268-m depth with a better age model in the interval of interest (Table S1 in the supporting information). We also ran triplicate B/Ca analyses in the 100- to 150-cm interval of 90GGC to isolate any stratigraphically displaced samples.

### 2.2. B/Ca Calibration

B/Ca analyses were performed on the benthic foraminiferal species *Cibicidoides pachyderma*. Although previous B/Ca reconstructions from deeper sites have primarily relied on the epibenthic species *Cibicidoides*
wuellerstorfi, the overall abundance of C. wuellerstorfi at intermediate-depth sites is low because this represents the upper edge of its depth habitat (Van Morkhoven et al., 1986). We instead used C. pachyderma for the Brazil Margin site, which has a B/Ca sensitivity to Δ[CO₃²⁻] similar to that of C. wuellerstorfi (Oppo et al., 2018). While calibrations for C. wuellerstorfi and Cibicidoides mundulus are based on globally distributed core top data (Yu & Elderfield, 2007), the current C. pachyderma calibration is regionally limited to data from the Demerara Rise off the northern coast of Brazil. As such, the number of data points in the calibration is considerably lower than for the other species (n = 10, r² = 0.72; Oppo et al., 2018). The 1σ calibration uncertainty in the B/Ca range of our samples is approximately ±10 μmol/kg [CO₃²⁻]. Despite the relatively limited number of data points, the core top calibration data set for C. pachyderma is the most appropriate for our study.

### 2.3. Foram Cleaning and Analysis

In this study, an average of three to four tests (>250-μm size fraction) were used for each analysis. Following the procedure outlined in Yu and Elderfield (2007), samples were crushed between two slides and homogenized with the aid of a high-powered reflected-light microscope. The chambers of C. pachyderma were finely ruptured in order to promote complete dissolution. Note that the following steps were conducted in a laminar flow hood with a B-free high-efficiency particulate air filter. Crushed samples were washed into 600-μl microcentrifuge tubes using Milli-Q water and ultrasonicated for 45 s to bring any clay present into suspension. Suspended clays were stirred and removed by squirting Milli-Q water into each tube and siphoning out the supernatant. This procedure was replicated twice, with additional rinses using methanol until sonication yielded a clear, particle-free fluid. A dual-haired picking brush was used to remove exceptionally discolored test fragments and foreign materials such as microscopic fibers and pyrite that remained after sonication. The samples then underwent oxidative cleaning to remove organic matter using a buffered H₂O₂ solution (100 μl 30% v/v H₂O₂ + 10 ml 0.1 M NaOH). Finally, samples were leached using a weak acid solution (0.001 M HNO₃) before dissolution in 500 μl of 2% HNO₃. Cleaned samples were analyzed for B/Ca using an Element-2 ICP-MS and ESI SC-2DX autosampler, where all samples were matrix matched to our 100-ppm [Ca] calibration standards. All cleaning and analysis was done at the UConn Avery Point Paleoclimate Laboratory.

### 2.4. Matrix Effects

Matrix effects stemming from small (5 to 20 ppm) Ca concentration mismatches between calibration standards and sample unknowns may bias B/Ca results. Yu et al. (2005) show that the accuracy of Cd/Ca and Zn/Ca ratios in standards decreases by ~10% and ~15%, respectively, when run at 180-ppm [Ca] versus 100-ppm [Ca]. However, trace elemental ratios Li/Ca, Mg/Ca, Al/Ca, Mn/Ca, and Sr/Ca yielded an accuracy of ±2.5% across a broad concentration range of 60- to 240-ppm [Ca]. To quantify matrix effects for B/Ca, we ran B/Ca standards with [Ca] ranging from 50 to 300 ppm using a 100-ppm calibration standard. We found that standards run in the 50- to 250-ppm range fell within ±2.5% of expected B/Ca values, while standards run at 300 ppm had B/Ca ratios 3% lower than their gravimetric values. These results suggest that matrix effects have a minimal influence on B/Ca analyses over a broad range of Ca concentrations.

To assess the potential influence of matrix effects on our unknowns, we subtracted the mean B/Ca at each depth from individual B/Ca values at the same depth and then plotted the residual B/Ca values versus [Ca] (Figure S1). The results indicate a ~0.2-μmol/mol B/Ca per ppm [Ca] relationship over the range of measured [Ca] values, suggesting a subtle but discernible matrix effect in our data. To assess whether this materially influenced the B/Ca time series for 90GGC, we plotted residual values versus depth in the core, where the residuals were calculated in two different ways. First, we estimated the residuals by subtracting the mean B/Ca at each depth from individual B/Ca values at the same depth (as in Figure S1). In the second case, we used a running mean calculated over a range of stratigraphic windows, including 10, 20, 25 and 30 cm (Figure S2). Regardless of the approach, we found no systematic relationship versus depth in the core. Thus, the observed downcore signal reflects reliable changes in B/Ca through time as opposed to any systematic bias associated with matrix effects.

### 2.5. Modern and Paleo-[CO₃²⁻]

Modern carbonate ion concentrations for the Brazil Margin were estimated using the local and regional hydrographic parameters presented in Table 1. Potential temperature and salinity values at 1,100-m water
Table 1
Parameters for Estimating Modern [CO$_3^{2−}$] at the 90GGC Core Site

| Water depth (m) | Potential temperature (°C) | S | PO$_4^{3−}$ (μmol/kg) | SiO$_3^{2−}$ (μmol/kg) | Avg. ALK (μmol/kg) | Avg. ΣCO$_2$ (μmol/kg) | [CO$_3^{2−}$] (μmol/kg) |
|----------------|-----------------------------|---|------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| 1105           | 3.59                        | 34.34 | 2.3                    | 35                      | 2,303 ± 21          | 2,189 ± 2              | 90 ± 10                   |

Downcore estimates of [CO$_3^{2−}$] were determined using the following empirical calibration: B/Ca = 1.134x + 102.35, where x is δ[CO$_3^{2−}$] for C. pachyderma (Oppo et al., 2018). We then estimated [CO$_3^{2−}$] using the relationship [CO$_3^{2−}$] = [CO$_3^{2−}$]$_{sat}$ (Δ[CO$_3^{2−}$] = [CO$_3^{2−}$]$_{sat}$) (Table 1). Finally, our estimates of ΣCO$_2$ are based on the carbonate alkalinity relationship ΣCO$_2$ ≈ ALK − [CO$_3^{2−}$]/0.6 (Yu et al., 2016).

2.6. Sources of Phosphate

WOCE observations of temperature, salinity, phosphate, dissolved oxygen, nitrate, δ$^18$O, and δ$^13$C (Gouretski & Koltermann, 2004) were inverted to determine water-mass pathways and the sources of phosphate in the subsurface ocean (Gebbie, 2014). The distribution of remineralized phosphate at the Brazil Margin is diagnosed as the difference between the observed phosphate and the distribution that would result if phosphate were a conservative tracer (i.e., the preformed value). This preformed value is calculated with the surface phosphate concentration and the water-mass fraction of the Brazil Margin as solved by the inversion. A second diagnostic is used to map the surface locations that are the source of the remineralized phosphate at the Brazil Margin. Assuming that the water-mass pathways represent a steady state circulation, we trace subsurface Brazil Margin waters back toward their surface sources and account for the locations where phosphate is added along the journey. We infer that the source of remineralized phosphate sources is biological productivity in the overlying surface ocean. Through this two-step tracking, we obtain a map of the source locations of remineralized phosphate. Our estimates of remineralized phosphate are indirectly constrained by nitrate and oxygen through fixed stochiometric ratios. Geometric constraints are also enforced, where remineralized phosphate can only increase as subsurface waters age (Gebbie & Huybers, 2010).

3. Results

The Brazil Margin [CO$_3^{2−}$] time series is characterized by three distinct intervals from the late LGM (18–20 kyr BP) to the early Holocene (8–10 kyr BP; Figure 2). During the late LGM, the mean [CO$_3^{2−}$] was 108 ± 1 μmol/kg, or ~20 μmol/kg higher than today (note that all uncertainties are presented as 1 standard error unless stated otherwise). From 18 to 16 kyr BP, [CO$_3^{2−}$] abruptly increased by ~22 μmol/kg, achieving a maximum value of 130 ± 2 μmol/kg during HS1. Over this same interval, benthic δ$^13$C increased by 0.4% ± 0.03‰, while benthic δ$^18$O decreased by 0.30‰ ± 0.05‰ (Curry & Oppo, 2005; Umling et al., 2019). The HS1 [CO$_3^{2−}$] maximum was followed by a gradual ~10-μmol/kg decline into the late Bolling-Allerød (~13 kyr BP). The beginning of the Younger Dryas (YD) marks a third inflection point in the [CO$_3^{2−}$] record, where values increased by ~5 μmol/kg followed by a slight decrease entering the early Holocene. Given the modern [CO$_3^{2−}$] value at the core site (90 ± 10 μmol/kg), we would expect that [CO$_3^{2−}$] decreased through the Holocene. However, the lack of C. pachyderma above 50-cm depth (8 kyr BP) precludes a comparison between core top and water-column [CO$_3^{2−}$] values.
The 90GGC record displays the opposite \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) signal of that recorded at two middepth (1,800–2,100 m) sites on the Brazil Margin. While all three records display the largest signal during HS1, results from 1,800 m imply that \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) decreased by ~20 \(\mu\text{mol/kg}\) (Figure 2). A similar pattern occurred at 2,100‐m water depth (Lacerra et al., 2017). The deeper sites also display a more gradual change, with \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) values declining monotonically from ~18 to 15 kyr BP, while the 90GGC results appear to show a more abrupt deglacial shift from ~17 to 16 kyr BP. Consequently, the vertical gradient in \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) between ~1 and 2 km changed markedly during the deglaciation, starting with little to no difference at 20 kyr BP and reaching an offset of 40 \(\mu\text{mol/kg}\) by 16 kyr BP (Figure 2).

4. Discussion

The abrupt increase in \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) of ~20 \(\mu\text{mol/kg}\) suggests the intermediate‐depth South Atlantic experienced a major shift in carbon cycling during HS1. Several factors could have contributed to the signal, including variations in alkalinity, \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) solubility, atmospheric \(p\text{CO}_2\), biological remineralization, and outgassing from the Southern Ocean. Below we first address the ALK, solubility, and atmospheric \(p\text{CO}_2\) effects. After showing that these factors had little overall impact on \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\), we then evaluate whether remineralization or outgassing was the more likely driver of the \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) signal.

4.1. Alkalinity, Solubility, and Atmospheric \(p\text{CO}_2\)

Given that \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) is a function of both alkalinity and \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\), increasing ALK could have caused the observed \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) response. We believe this is unlikely, however, given that average changes in oceanic ALK would have a lagged response to any deglacial changes in carbonate preservation in the abyss. While local changes in the ALK associated with AAIW may have influenced the 90GGC record, model simulations of ALK anomalies 1,000 years after AMOC collapse show little change in the upper 1,500 m of the South Atlantic.
Atlantic (0–10 μmol/kg; Figure S3). The model used in Schmittner and Lund (2015) lacks an interactive sediment component, however, so we cannot rule out calcite dissolution as a source of ALK. Given that the core site is located well above the carbonate compensation depth, a local source of ALK is unlikely, so the signal would need to be driven by dissolution deeper in the water column. Yet the mid-depth \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) signal is opposite that at intermediate depths, indicating that basin-scale alkalinity changes cannot account for the \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) anomalies (Figure 2). If enhanced \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) storage and CaCO₃ dissolution at mid-depths yielded a positive ALK signal at shallower sites, we would also expect such a signal to lag the mid-depth \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) time series. Instead, \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) at intermediate depth appears to lead the mid-depth carbonate ion record (Figure 2).

Finally, the \(\text{CO}_3\) record from Brazil Margin core 36GGC (1,270-m water depth) lacks a clear signal during HS1, implying there was little change in carbonate dissolution at intermediate depths (Figure S4). The available evidence therefore suggests that ALK played a minor role in the intermediate-depth \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) response. Assuming that \(\text{E}_27 \approx \text{ALK} – \frac{[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]}{0.6}\) (Yu et al., 2016), the \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) data imply that \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) decreased by approximately 37 μmol/kg during HS1.

The implied \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) change may be related to weakening of the solubility pump. Several lines of evidence suggest that surface temperatures in Antarctica and the Southern Ocean warmed during the LGM-HSI transition (Barker et al., 2009; Pedro et al., 2011; Shakun et al., 2012), which would decrease \(\text{CO}_2\) solubility in surface waters and yield a negative \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) signal at our core site. Of particular relevance is the surface temperature signal between the Polar Front and the Sub-Antarctic Front, where AAIW isopycnals outcrop to the surface Southern Ocean (Carter et al., 2008). To estimate surface temperatures in this zone, we use benthic \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) records from Brazil Margin cores 90GGC and 14GGC (440-m depth; Figure S6). While \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) in 90GGC should reflect sea surface temperatures (SSTs) in the source region for AAIW, the \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) from 14GGC will reflect SSTs in the source region for Sub-Antarctic Mode Water. Additionally, planktonic \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) results from the Brazil Margin based on the thermocline-dwelling \(N.\ dutertrei\) will be influenced by temperatures in the Subtropical Mode Water formation region where the Malvinas and Brazil Currents converge (Lund et al., 2019; Provost et al., 1999). Over the same time interval used to estimate the 90GGC \([\text{CO}_3^{2-}]\) signal, we estimate that benthic \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) decreased by 0.3‰ ± 0.05‰ in 90GGC and 0.5‰ ± 0.06‰ in 14GGC (Lund et al., 2015). By comparison, the change was somewhat smaller in the \(N.\ dutertrei\) record (0.20‰ ± 0.18‰; Hertzberg et al., 2016). If the \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) change was entirely due to temperature, the data imply that SSTs increased 1 to 2.5 °C. Assuming modern carbonate system parameters, the SST warming would yield an associated \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) response of ~18 ± 5 μmol/kg (Table S3). This is the maximum temperature effect because input of isotopically light melt water would act to lower surface water \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) in the Southern Ocean (and therefore benthic foraminiferal \(\delta^{18}\text{O}\) at the Brazil Margin) Figure 3.

If rising temperatures were the only factor controlling preformed \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) in the surface Southern Ocean, then a reduction in preformed \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) could account for as much as 50% of the HS1 signal. However, atmospheric \(\text{CO}_2\) concentrations also rose by ~30 ppm from the late LGM to mid-HSI (Marcott et al., 2014), which would increase preformed \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) in surface waters. Accounting for higher surface water p\(\text{CO}_2\) and warming SSTs, the net change in preformed \(\Sigma\text{CO}_2\) becomes +12 ± 5 μmol/kg. Rising atmospheric p\(\text{CO}_2\) therefore more than...
Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology

compensates for the solubility effect, implying that other factors must have caused the inferred $\Sigma CO_2$ decline at 90GGC during HS1.

While warming Southern Hemisphere SSTs likely influence Brazil Margin $\delta^{18}O$ records during HS1 (Pedro et al., 2011), the effect of subsurface warming due to AMOC collapse must also be considered. Liu et al. (2009) show that simulated weakening of the AMOC from an LGM state reduces convective heat exchange in the North Atlantic as well as northward heat transport, warming subsurface waters in the South Atlantic down to ~2,000-m water depth. At intermediate depths, simulated temperatures increased by 1.5 to 2 °C (Liu et al., 2009), somewhat smaller than the reconstructed HS1 signal for 90GGC based on the Mg/Li ratio of benthic foraminifera (2–3 °C; Umling et al., 2019). These results suggest that 75% to 100% of the $\delta^{18}O$ signal at the core site can be attributed to subsurface warming. If this was the case, there would have been little SST change in AAIW source regions during HS1. This scenario would require an alternative mechanism for reducing preformed $CO_2$ or an even larger reduction in remineralization to explain the observed $[CO_3^{2-}]$ signal (see below).

4.2. Remineralization as a Driver of $\Sigma CO_2$ Decline

If collapse of the AMOC triggered the 90GGC $[CO_3^{2-}]$ response through modulation of the biological pump, then the magnitude of the observed signal should be similar to the modeled anomalies. The observed signal falls within the range of the simulated 20- to 30-μmol/kg increase in $[CO_3^{2-}]$ at intermediate depths (Figure 4). Note that there is a steep vertical gradient in the modeled anomalies in this depth range, with the signal doubling between 1,000- and 750-m water depth. Slight changes in the depth of this anomaly could therefore yield different estimates of the $[CO_3^{2-}]$ response. Furthermore, considering that the AMOC weakening simulations in Schmittner and Lund (2015) utilize preindustrial initial conditions, it is possible that future simulations using more realistic LGM initial conditions may yield different results. Nevertheless, the good agreement between modeled and observed $[CO_3^{2-}]$ anomalies suggests remineralization is a viable explanation of the $[CO_3^{2-}]$ trends in 90GGC. The agreement between modeled and observed $\delta^{13}C$ anomalies at this core site is also consistent with the biological pump mechanism (Figures 2 and S5; Hertzberg et al., 2016).

The positive shift in $[CO_3^{2-}]$ at intermediate depths occurs within ~1 kyr of negative shifts in $[CO_3^{2-}]$ at mid-depth Brazil Margin sites (Figure 2). Paired analysis of benthic $\delta^{13}C$ and $[CO_3^{2-}]$ suggests the mid-depth $\delta^{13}C$ anomalies are most likely due to accumulation of respired carbon associated with weakening of the AMOC (Lacerra et al., 2017). Mass balance calculations imply that remineralization can account for two thirds of the $\delta^{13}C$ signal at middepth, consistent with the proportion inferred through simulated collapse of the AMOC (Schmittner & Lund, 2015). We can use a similar approach to assess whether the deglacial $\delta^{13}C$ anomaly in 90GGC is consistent with remineralization. As in Lacerra et al. (2017), we use the following mass balance equations:

$$ (\delta^{13}C_{\text{Final}}) \times (\Sigma CO_2 \text{ Final}) = (\delta^{13}C_{\text{LGM}}) \times (\Sigma CO_2 \text{ LGM}) - (\delta^{13}C_{\text{Removed}}) \times (\Sigma CO_2 \text{ Removed}) $$

$$ \Sigma CO_2 \text{ Final} = \Sigma CO_2 \text{ LGM} - \Sigma CO_2 \text{ Removed} $$

where $\delta^{13}C_{\text{Final}}$ represents $\delta^{13}C$ after the change in remineralization, $\delta^{13}C_{\text{LGM}}$ is the mean $\delta^{13}C$ prior to HS1 (18–20 kyr BP; 0.39‰ ± 0.03‰), $\Sigma CO_2 \text{ Removed}$ is the estimated change in $\Sigma CO_2$ (37 μmol/kg), and $\delta^{13}C_{\text{Removed}}$ represents the mean value for marine organic carbon from 30°S to 60°S (~23‰ ± 2‰; Goericke & Fry, 1994). Finally, we assume $\Sigma CO_2 \text{ LGM}$ was 2,200 μmol/kg, with a conservative error estimate of ±100 μmol/kg. Although estimates for $\Sigma CO_2 \text{ LGM}$ currently do not exist, the assigned value has little influence on the final $\delta^{13}C$ estimate due to the small relative error (5%). Our mass balance calculation yields a $\delta^{13}C_{\text{Final}}$ of 0.79‰ ± 0.07‰, implying the change in $\delta^{13}C$ due to remineralization ($\delta^{13}C_{\text{rem}}$) was 0.4‰ ± 0.07‰. By comparison, the observed benthic $\delta^{13}C$ signal during the LGM-HS1 transition is 0.45‰ ± 0.04‰ (Figure 2). A reduction in remineralization equivalent to that implied by our B/Ca results could therefore explain 90‰ ± 20% of the $\delta^{13}C$ signal. The uncertainty in our estimate suggests that a positive shift in preformed $\delta^{13}C$ ($\delta^{13}C_{\text{pre}}$) could account for up to 30%. Because warming SSTs would have the opposite effect on $\delta^{13}C_{\text{pre}}$, any positive $\delta^{13}C_{\text{pre}}$ signal would require greater air-sea gas exchange.
The results of Umling et al. (2019) suggest that air-sea gas exchange signature of water masses bathing the site may account for the HS1 $\delta^{13}C$ signal. In their study, Cd/Ca (a proxy for ambient phosphate concentrations) in core 90GGC remains relatively constant throughout HS1 instead of decreasing as expected due to less remineralization (Schmittner & Lund, 2015) or deepening of the thermocline (Hain et al., 2014; Umling et al., 2019). Two or more mechanisms working in concert may have produced a net increase in $\delta^{13}C$ and no net change in Cd/Ca. One possibility is that the core site was influenced by a water mass with higher nutrients and a higher $\delta^{13}C_{\text{air-sea}}$, which balanced the expected decline in nutrients (Umling et al., 2019). While such a mechanism would imply that remineralization played less of a role in driving the HS1 $\delta^{13}C$ signal, the $\delta^{13}C_{\text{air}}$ increase may have been compensated by a $\delta^{13}C$ decrease associated with a nutrient-rich water mass. If so, the observed benthic $\delta^{13}C$ response could still be attributed to reduced remineralization. It is also worth noting that the observed differences in Cd/PO$_4$ ratios between water masses (Middag et al., 2018) suggest that interpretation of Cd/Ca time series is not straightforward and may reflect the influence of different water mass mixtures at the core site. Regardless of the complexities associated with $\delta^{13}C$, the B/Ca on their own suggest that total $\Sigma$CO$_2$ increased during HS1, which we believe is most easily explained via remineralization.

**4.3. Modern Context for the Remineralization Scenario**

Remineralization plays a central role in setting $\delta^{13}C$ and phosphate levels at intermediate depths in the South Atlantic. Today, the concentration of remineralized phosphate at the 90GGC core site is

![Figure 4. Simulated $[CO_3^{2-}]$ response due to Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) collapse (Schmittner & Lund, 2015). (a–c) Preindustrial $[CO_3^{2-}]$ for the Atlantic, Indian, and Pacific basins. (d–f) $[CO_3^{2-}]$ 1,000 years after AMOC shutdown. (g–i) The associated $[CO_3^{2-}]$ anomalies for each basin. The white circle in (g) marks the location of core 90GGC. Positive anomalies at intermediate depth reflect less input of remineralized carbon. The large negative anomalies in the middepth Atlantic are due to accumulation of light carbon (Schmittner & Lund, 2015).](image-url)
approximately 0.7 μmol/kg, or 35% of the total phosphate (Figure 5a). Assuming a C:P ratio for marine organic matter of 117:1 (Anderson & Sarmiento, 1994) and little change in local ALK, the 37-μmol/kg ΣCO₂ anomaly during HS1 is equivalent to a decrease in remineralized phosphate of approximately 0.3 μmol/kg, or ~40% of the modern remineralized component. Note that the fractional change may have been different during the LGM-HS1 transition due a higher baseline remineralized component during the LGM or shifts in Southern Ocean frontal positions that could influence the amount of remineralized carbon accumulated by AAIW on its path to the core site. Nevertheless, the modern values provide a useful point of comparison and suggest that the reconstructed change in remineralized phosphate during HS1 is not unreasonable.

Our water mass decomposition results show that the source of remineralized phosphate can be traced to the western South Atlantic and Southern Ocean, with the vast majority of the signal originating in the sub-Antarctic from 40°S to 60°S (Figure 5b). Maps of satellite-derived chl-a concentrations suggest this is one of the highest-productivity regions in the Southern Ocean (Deppeler & Davidson, 2017). Given the connection between remineralized phosphate at the Brazil Margin and biological productivity in the Southern Ocean, we suggest that the carbonate ion results in 90GGC reflect the influence of export production in the sub-Antarctic during the last deglaciation. In this sense, the core site may remotely monitor the Southern Ocean because (1) byproducts of respiration accumulate along the flow path of AAIW from the Southern Ocean to the core site and (2) there is relatively little local production of remineralized phosphate at the Brazil Margin due to its oligotrophic location (Figure 5b).

If the carbonate ion signal were entirely due to remineralization, our data would suggest that productivity in the western sub-Antarctic portion of the Southern Ocean decreased by ~40% relative to modern conditions. While this is a large signal, it is comparable to the simulated 10–40% decrease in export production associated with collapse of the AMOC (Schmittner, 2005). Note that this simulation is based on climatological winds, so it does not include the possibility of variable dust transport and iron fertilization in the sub-Antarctic (e.g., Martínez-García et al., 2014). Foram-bound iron flux, δ15N, and alkenone flux results from ODP Site 1090 both decrease during the LGM-HS1 transition, consistent with a weakening of the SAZ.
biological pump (Martinez-Garcia et al., 2009; Martinez-Garcia et al., 2014). However, the δ¹³C and alkenone flux signals occur ~1,000 years prior to the 90GGC [CO₂⁻²] signal (Figure 6), although this may be related to low sedimentation rates in ODP Site 1090 (2–3 cm/kyr) and age model uncertainty during HSI (Martinez-Garcia et al., 2014). The location of site 1090 (42°S, 8°E) also lies well outside of the implied source regions for remineralized phosphate for the Brazil Margin (Figure 5b). Furthermore, model reconstructions of glacial atmospheric dust flux to the Southern Ocean suggest values were highest in the western sub-Antarctic sector of the SAZ (Mahowald et al., 2006; Martinez-Garcia et al., 2014), in close alignment with the remineralized phosphate map in Figure 5b. Additional compilations of dust flux, foram-bound δ¹⁵N, and alkenone flux results from the western sub-Antarctic portion of the Atlantic will be necessary to assess whether productivity was the driver of the [CO₂⁻²] signal at the Brazil Margin.

If the Brazil Margin signal was predominately driven by variations in Southern Ocean productivity, then we would expect other intermediate-depth cores influenced by AAIW to show a similar change in [CO₂⁻²⁻²]. One such reconstruction from core RR0503-83 at ~1,600-m water depth near New Zealand indicates that [CO₂⁻²] increased by ~25 µmol/kg from 18 to 15 kyr BP (Allen et al., 2015). The magnitude is similar to that recorded at our core site, but the signal is delayed by approximately 1 kyr (Figure 6). The modern hydrography at RR0503-83 is primarily influenced by Upper Circumpolar Deep Water (UCDW), which sits just below AAIW at the core site location (Allen et al., 2015). Although Allen et al. (2015) interpreted the [CO₂⁻²] record as evidence of carbon release from the deep ocean, their results could also reflect weakening of the biological pump. Indeed, the modeled [CO₂⁻²] increase at 1,600-m near New Zealand due to remineralization is ~20 µmol/kg, which reflects downward mixing of the remineralization signal from intermediate depths (Figure 4). In this scenario, the lag between 90GGC and RR0503-83 may reflect the initial influence of reduced carbon flux to intermediate depths, followed by a delayed signal deeper in the water column due to mixing with UCDW.

### 4.4. Assessing the Deep Ventilation Hypothesis

Alternatively, the [CO₂⁻²⁻²] signals in the SW Pacific and SW Atlantic may be related to enhanced outgassing of CO₂ in the Southern Ocean, as suggested by Allen et al. (2015). The air-sea flux of CO₂ is a function of the air-sea pCO₂ difference, the gas transfer velocity for CO₂, and the solubility of CO₂ in seawater (Takahashi et al., 2002). Given that atmospheric CO₂ increased by 35 ppmv during HSI1, net flux out of the ocean would require an even larger increase in surface ocean pCO₂. As discussed in section 4.1, rising atmospheric CO₂ and reduced solubility due to warming in AAIW formation regions would have yielded little net change in surface ocean ΣCO₂ concentrations. Enhanced outgassing would therefore require higher ΣCO₂ values, most likely due to wind-driven upwelling of carbon-rich waters from the deep ocean (e.g., Anderson et al., 2009).

Deep-sea coral δ¹¹B (a proxy for pH) data from the Drake Passage (Rae et al., 2018) and opal flux results from the Atlantic sector of the Antarctic Zone (Anderson et al., 2009) suggest that abyssal carbon played an important role in the overall deglacial CO₂ rise. However, the largest changes in opal flux appear to occur after the initial 30-ppmv rise in atmospheric CO₂ (Figure 3). Furthermore, the resolution of the deep-sea coral results precludes a clear...
assessment of the timing of pH variability during HS1. Transfer of CO₂ from the deep ocean to intermediate depths is most clearly observed in the converging δ¹³B records at the end of HS1, at the approximate time of maximum opal flux (Figure 3).

Model results suggest that realistic changes in Southern Hemisphere westerly winds have only a modest influence on outgassing in the Southern Ocean (Menviel et al., 2018). An imposed 0.2-Sv decrease in freshwater flux to AABW formation regions, which doubles AABW production and drives upwelling of carbon-rich water from the abyss, combined with enhanced SW westerlies, yields a 20-ppmv increase in atmospheric CO₂ (Menviel et al., 2018). In this experiment, however, ΣCO₂ at intermediate depths in the South Atlantic increase by ~60 μmol/kg, opposite the signal implied by our [CO₃²⁻] results. Overall, the deglacial ΣCO₂ anomalies simulated by Menviel et al. (2018) are much larger than implied by published deep ocean [CO₃²⁻] reconstructions (Table S4). By comparison, weakening of the biological pump yields a better fit between simulated and estimated ΣCO₂ anomalies (Table S4 and Figure S7).

Can the expected change in δ¹³C associated with deep upwelling be reconciled with the observed 0.4‰ increase of δ¹³C in the Southwest Atlantic? One possible explanation is greater air-sea equilibration during HS1. Today, sub-Antarctic surface waters are characterized by δ¹³C values up to 1‰ higher than expected from biological processes, apparently due to partial equilibration with the atmosphere at cold temperatures (Charles & Fairbanks, 1990; Oppo & Fairbanks, 1989). This “thermodynamic” δ¹³C signal is carried northward by AAIW, with an imprint on δ¹³C in the intermediate-depth South Atlantic of approximately 0.4‰ (Charles et al., 1993). Model results suggest that doubling of air-sea gas exchange yields 0.2-0.4‰ higher δ¹³C in the surface Southern Ocean (Broecker & Maier-Reimer, 1992). Alternatively, the δ¹³C signal may have been driven by AAIW mixing with a more nutrient-rich water mass with higher δ¹³C (Umling et al., 2019). Changes to δ¹³C could therefore feasibly produce the positive HS1 δ¹³C at our core site. However, the proposed process would need to yield a signal large enough to overcome the combined effects of upwelling of light carbon in the Southern Ocean, exchange with a more δ¹³C-depleted atmosphere, and warmer equilibration temperatures. While we cannot rule out this scenario, we believe that the simpler explanation of the positive δ¹³C anomaly during HS1 is reduced remineralization.

4.5. Longer-Term Variability

Following the LGM-HS1 transition, the 90GGC [CO₃²⁻] record varies in step with proxies of the AMOC while also displaying longer-term variability on glacial-interglacial time scales. If the biological pump weakened in response to an AMOC collapse early in HS1, then it should rebound during the Bølling-Allerød (B-A) when AMOC circulation was reinvigorated. In this scenario, we would expect a decrease in [CO₃²⁻] during the B-A (12.9–14.5 kyr BP) followed by an increase during the YD (11.5–12.9 kyr BP) when the AMOC collapsed again. Our [CO₃²⁻] record is broadly consistent with the expected pattern, showing that [CO₃²⁻] decreased ~10 μmol/kg during the B-A and rose ~5 μmol/kg during the YD (Figure 3). Note that there is a ~500-year (2σ) error for the 90GGC age model during the B-A (Lund et al., 2015), which complicates interpretation of this part of the record. Nonetheless, it appears the AMOC-modulated changes in the biological pump could account for the millennial-scale changes in [CO₃²⁻].

If [CO₃²⁻] responded primarily to AMOC-driven changes in the biological pump, then it should return to LGM levels upon strengthening of the AMOC after the YD. However, the AMOC instead remained elevated throughout the remainder of the deglaciation and then declined slightly during the early Holocene (Figure 3). One important factor driving the observed trend was likely rising local ALK from mid-HS1 to ~12 kyr BP. During this interval, %CaCO₃ in core 36GGC (1,270-m water depth) increased by ~15%, indicating greater CaCO₃ preservation and higher ambient ALK concentrations, where higher ALK would prevent [CO₃²⁻] from decreasing back to LGM levels (Figure S4). After 12 kyr BP, %CaCO₃ remained consistently high into the Holocene and may explain higher intermediate-depth [CO₃²⁻] values observed at core 90GGC relative to during the LGM.

5. Conclusions

The mechanisms responsible for the rise in atmospheric CO₂ during the last deglaciation have been a primary focus of paleoclimatologists for over 30 years. In this study, we propose that the initial ~30-ppmv
rise in atmospheric CO₂ may be explained by a reduction in global average biological pump efficiency, a result of (1) reduced AMOC circulation, (2) less complete consumption of macronutrients in the SAZ in response to changes in iron fertilization, or a combination of the two. Here we explore past variability in upper ocean carbon cycling by reconstructing [CO₃²⁻] using an intermediate-depth core from the Southwest Atlantic. Our results show a pronounced increase in [CO₃²⁻] that was contemporaneous with the initial rise in atmospheric CO₂. Given that rising atmospheric CO₂ would compensate for reduced CO₂ solubility associated with warmer SSTs, we infer that the carbonate ion signal reflects reduced accumulation of remineralized carbon from the AAIW formation region to the core site.

Mass balance calculations suggest that the majority of the δ¹³C signal during the LGM to HS1 transition can be explained by reduced input of remineralized carbon, though we cannot rule out changes in air-sea gas exchange in AAIW source regions as an alternative driver. Modern AAIW carries a large remineralization signal, accounting for ~40% of the total phosphate concentrations at our core site relative to modern values. We propose that reduced export production in the sub-Antarctic region of the Southern Ocean imparted a large positive [CO₃²⁻] signal on intermediate-depth waters that was recorded in core 90GGC. Given the oligotrophic conditions in subtropical gyres and generally abundant carbonate in underlying sediments, locations such as 90GGC may be used for remotely monitoring export production in the sub-Antarctic. Though records of nutrient utilization efficiency and export production from the Atlantic sector of the SAZ exhibit the expected deglacial pattern under the biological pump hypothesis (Martínez-García et al., 2014), they are offset from the 90GGC [CO₃²⁻] signal by ~1,000 years. Considering the age model uncertainties and sedimentation rates associated with these records and their location in the Atlantic sector of the SAZ, future research should include direct investigation of surface ocean productivity changes in the Atlantic sector of the sub-Antarctic using high-resolution cores to determine whether productivity in these regions declined early in the deglaciation. Furthermore, while [CO₃²⁻] data from 1.6-km water depth in the South Pacific (Allen et al., 2015) are generally consistent with our results, the greater influence of UCDW at this location complicates comparison with our [CO₃²⁻] record. Thus, high-resolution [CO₃²⁻] time series from intermediate depths are also necessary to corroborate our results from the Southwest Atlantic.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Bärbel Hönisch at Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University for help with methods development and Sarah McCart for technical assistance with ICP-MS analyses. We would also like to give special thanks to Anna Lisa Mudahy, who was responsible for picking a substantial portion of the benthic foraminifera used in this study. We are grateful to the WHOI core lab for sample collection and archiving. This work was supported by NSF grant OCE-1702231 to D. L.

References


